June 20, 2013

To:

United States District Court
Southern District of New York
Clerk of the Court
Daniel Patrick Moynihan
United States Courthouse
500 Pearl Street
New York, NY 10007-1312

Bernstein Litowitz Berger & Grossman LLP Max W. Berger, Esq. Steven B. Singer, Esq. John C. Browne, Esq. 1285 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10019

Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton & Garrison LLP Brad Karp, Esq. Richard A. Rosen, Esq. Susanna M. Buergel, Esq. 1285 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10019-6064

United States District Court Southern District of New York

IN RE CITIGROUP INC. BOND LITIGATION

Master File No 08 Civ 9522 (SHS)

**ECF Case** 

### **OBJECTION TO SETTLEMENT**

Objector: Bruce M. Smackey

418 N. Pine Top Circle Bethlehem, PA 18017

610-952-3341

Bond Class Member - 1500 shares

CUSIP 1731OG202; 6.5% E - TRUPS Citigroup Capital XV

Objector's Signature:

USDC SDNY
DOCUMENT
ELECTRONICA FILED
DOC #:
DATE FILED: 7/2/3

ruce M. Smoekey Date: June 20, 2013

Objector has not submitted a written request for exclusion.

### **Outline**

- 1.0 Statement of Bond Class Member's Objection, Specific Reasons and Legal and Evidentiary Support
- 2.0 Documents Proving Membership in Bond Case
- 3.0 Filing of Request for Notice of Appearance at Settlement Fairness Hearing on July 23, 2013 at 10:00 AM
- 4.0 Summary Recommendations to the Court
- 1.0 <u>Statement of Bond Class Member's Objection, Specific Reasons and Legal and Evidentiary Support</u>

As stated in NOTICE any Bond Class Member who does not request exclusion may object to

- (i) the Settlement
- (ii) the proposed Plan of Allocation
- (iii) Bond Counsel's motion for an Award of Attorneys' Fees and Reimbursement of Litigation Expenses

The above three components of the Bond Litigation and the proposed action to be taken by the Settlement Fairness Hearing are interdependent; however, this filed Objection pertains only to the above (i) and (iii).

### The Settlement

With respect to (i) the Settlement, there is a complete lack of transparency in the methodology and reasonableness used in the determination of the cash payment of \$730,000,000 by Citigroup for the benefit of the Bond Class. This lack of transparency is manifested by (1) a reading of both the NOTICE, as well as the lengthy set of documents at <a href="https://www.citigroupbondactionsettlement.com">www.citigroupbondactionsettlement.com</a>; (2) a complete lack of communication by Merrill Lynch/Bank of America to the Objector about the litigation and (3) the non-responsiveness by Bond Counsel to repeated calls made by Objector.

Without transparency the \$730 Million cash payment is not accepted by the Objector when compared to the following relevant sums:

- (a) \$1.1 Billion and 44,000,000 shares for <u>just Citigroup Capital XV 6.5% Enhanced Trust Preferred Securities [E-TRUPS]</u>;
- (b) \$27.5 Billion total for public and private preferred securities; \$25 Billion in preferred securities held by U.S. Treasury amounting to \$52.5 Billion in aggregate;
- (c) \$326 Billion advanced to Citigroup by U.S. Government.

This case is a securities class action that asserts claims arising under the Securities Act and is based on alleged misrepresentations in the Offering Materials of 48 public offerings by Citigroup. In addition, Merrill Lynch's placing its fiduciary and custodian responsibility to its client (Objector) subservient to its own interests contributed significantly to shareholder damages. This complicity extends beyond Merrill Lynch's role as a lead underwriter in the initial offerings and for Merrill Lynch's scrutinizing the Offering Materials.

To wit the Registration Statement filed by Citigroup for the March 2009 Exchange Offer was a "red flag" that required Merrill Lynch to investigate the gravity of riskiness faced by Citigroup. Merrill Lynch should have sufficiently investigated the necessity for the Exchange Offer in order to have clarity in presenting alternatives to Merrill Lynch clients and shareholders of the preferred.

Additional Evidentiary Support for this Objection is displayed in the attached Exhibit [A] and Exhibit [B].

Exhibit [A] provides the Court with a Chronological Order of Events and highlights the significance of the EXCHANGE OFFER embedded in Merrill Lynch and Bank of America's own set of Securities Act misdeeds.

Exhibit [B] provides the Court with Historical Data of Common and Preferred Share Prices and Volumes ---data that could have been uncovered in the discovery process and used to determine the magnitude of <u>gains</u> realized by the defendants at the expense of shareholders.

### Bond Counsel's Motion for an Award of Attorneys' Fees and Reimbursement of Litigation Expenses

In Court Documents, reference is made of the 42.5 Million pages which have been reviewed and cited in the following sections:

- E. Bond Plaintiffs Conduct Extensive Discovery and Motion Practice
- E.1 Bond Plaintiffs Efforts in Document Discovery
- E.5 Bond Plaintiffs Efforts in Deposition Discovery
- E.6 Bond Plaintiffs Efforts in Expert Discovery

No specifics have been included to justify the approximate \$293 Million award for attorneys' fees and reimbursement of litigation expenses – a projected 40% out of a total \$730 Million cash settlement.

Hours spent times billing rates is a calculation not a justification. A reading of 42.5 million pages could be expected to require at least 300 million minutes. An attorneys' fees award of \$150 million would mean that attorneys performed their discovery at an hourly rate of \$30 or conducted a very superficial discovery process.

Key questions that should be asked and answered at the Hearing are:

- (1) How were attorneys' efforts used to determine the fairness and reasonableness of the \$730,000,000 figure for the proposed cash settlement?
- (2) Did attorneys conclude that the likelihood of attorneys' fees larger than \$300 million for any additional effort was unlikely to be awarded? Thus the proposed Settlement was not driven by what was fair and justified for the Plaintiffs, but was reached in the best interests of the attorneys who are co-located at the same 1285 Avenue of the Americas address.

### 2.0 Documents Proving Membership in Bond Case

(See attached Merrill Lynch internal documents for client's retirement account, purchase history of preferred shares and sales of all E-TRUPS/XV preferred shares.)

# 3.0 Filing Request for Notice of Appearance at Settlement Fairness Hearing on July 23, 2013 at 10:00 AM

The Objector is willing to come to the Hearing and present this Objection orally should the Court deem it advisable for the Court's judging the fairness and reasonableness of the Settlement.

### 4.0 Summary Recommendation to the Court

Within the NOTICE, [the <u>Proposed Plan of Allocation</u> and the <u>Calculation of Specific Recognized Loss or Gain Amounts</u>] is contained a modified methodology that is fair and reasonable to overcome OBJECTION (i) and (iii) described above.

The Objector proposes to the Court the following:

### Objection [i]

A. The Settlement cash amount to Plaintiffs is set at the total of all approved claims submitted in the <u>Proof of Claim and Release Form</u> and the respective amounts be distributed to Defendants.

### Objection [iii]

B. Based on the Hearing, the Court should fix the total amount to be awarded for attorneys' fees and reimbursement of litigation expenses and this amount be paid directly by Defendants above the amount determined in A.

Citigroup and Merrill Lynch are not in bankruptcy nor is this case a bankruptcy proceeding where very limited assets would be distributed to the Plaintiffs. Full restitution to the Plaintiffs awarded by the Court would be fair, reasonable, financially feasible and an exemplary action by the Court.

DATE	EVENT
9/7/2006	Citigroup Prospectus;Public Offering @\$25;\$1.1 B;44MM shsCapital XV 6.5% E-TRUPS Underwriter Merrill Lynch purchases 6,196,666 shs
2/13/2008	600 shs purchased by client [objector] on recommendation of ML for client's retirement account held by ML as custodian
5/21/2008	900 additional shs purchased by client on recommendation of ML
9/14/2008	Bank of America buys ML
Nov-08	US Government extends \$326 B to Citigroup
2/27/2009	Citi announces EXCHANGE OFFER for \$27.5B of preferred from private and public shrhlders and \$25B from US Treasury
7/10/2009	ML advises client that only alternatives under EXCHANGE OFFER are [1] accept EXCHANGE OFFER or [2] sell all 1500 shs the client sells all shs as the client was not told that holding shs was an alternative
7/24/2009	Table A of NOTICE states Conversion/Call/Redemption Price at \$19.95
4/16/2013	Citigroup Capital XV shs called @ \$25.00 per share

CHRONOLOGICAL ORDER OF EVENTS----EXHIBIT [A]

VOLUMES/PREFERRED	Preferred	Common	PRICES
Ö	\$25{12/2006}	\$200{6/2008}	
100,000{2/2008}	\$22{2/2008} \$18	\$200{6/2008} \$100{10/2008} \$75{1/2009} \$50{1/2011} \$50{6/2013}	
08}	{6/2008} \$14{9/	\$75{1/2009}	
4MM{2/2009}	2008} \$8{2/200	\$50{1/2011} \$	
/2009}	)9} \$5{ 4/2009}	50{6/2013}	
4MM{7/2009	\$19{7/2009}		
9}	\$25{12/2006} \$22{2/2008} \$18{6/2008} \$14{9/2008} \$8{2/2009} \$5{ 4/2009} \$19{7/2009} \$25{ 4/16/20013CALLED}		

HISTORICAL DATA of COMMON and PREFERRED SHARE PRICES and VOLUMES

EXHIBIT [B]



TOTAL MERRILL

Online at: www.mlol.ml.com

Account Number:

24-Hour Assistance: (800) MERRILL

MLPF& S CUST FPO BRUCE SMACKEY BASIC FBO BRUCE M SMACKEY 418 N PINE TOP OR BETHLEHEM PA 18017-1861

Net Portfolio Value:

\$686,061.18

Your Financial Advisor: WILLARD F JONES 7424 WINDSOR DR ALLENTOWN PA 18106 Willard\_I\_Jones@mi.com (877) 398-4239

# RETIREMENT ACCOUNT

TOTAL SELLS

1,500

July 01, 2009 - July 31, 2009

ASSETS		
	July 31	June 30
Cash/ Money Accounts	28,328.94	4,559.93
Fixed Income	348,799.93	364,719,51
Equities	133,885.00	122,644,36
Mutual Funds	173,794,30	162,899,22
Options	•	
Other		
Subtotal (Long Portfolio)	684,808.17	654,823.02
Estimated Accrued interest	1,253.01	835.17
TOTAL ASSETS	\$686,061.18	\$655,658.19
LIABILITIES		
Debit Balance		
TOTAL LIABILITIES		
NET PORTFOLIO VALUE	\$686.061.18	\$655.658.19

CASH FLOW		
	This Statement	Year to Date
Opening Cash/ Money Accounts	\$4,559.93	
CREDITS		
Funds Received		31,000.00
Bectronic Transfers		
Other Credits		0.27
Subtotal		31,000.27
DEBITS		
Bectronic Transfers		
Other Debits		(150.00)
Sublotal		(150.00)
Net Cash Flow	•	\$30,850.27
Dividends/ interest income	1,164.32	18,600.09
Dividend Reinvestments	(329.30)	(1,610.20)
Security Purchases/ Debits		(120,481,30)
Security Sales/ Credits	22,933.99	41,610.10
Closing Cash/ Money Accounts	\$28,328.94	
Securities You Transferred In/ Out		(30.51)

	AŅCIAL CONSULTANTS	10:46 06/03/13 PG 1 COB 06/01/13
	ECURITY DETAIL	FC:5056
ACCT: 838-89178 BRUCE SMACKEY	BASIC	
DESC: CITIGROUP CAP TRUST XV	SYM: 52GY3	QRQ: SEC NO: 52GY3
TRUST PFD SECS	CURR POS:	MKT VAL:
06.500% SEP 15 2066	CURR PX: 24.9688	STRATEGY: TECH:
DATE TYPE SOL QTY	PRICE NET AMOUNT	COMMENT
07/10/09 SLD N 1,500C	15.5000 22,933C	
05/21/08 BOT 900	21.7000 19,933	
02/13/08 BOT 100	23.4400 2,382	
02/13/08 BOT 300	23.4500 7,133	
02/13/08 BOT 200	23.5400 4,773	
=======================================	******	
TOTAL BUYS 1,500	TOTAL DEBITS	

FOR INFORMATION PURPOSES ONLY - ACCOUNT STATEMENT IS OFFICIAL RECORD THIS INFO MUST NOT BE USED IN PLACE OF THE MERRILL LYNCH TAX REPORTING STATEMENT FOR TAX INFORMATION.

<END>

TOTAL CREDITS

### BOUGHT CHICAGUE CAP TRUST-NOTAUST-ETP SECS DOLLAW WE'MY 196400 Filed 07/02/13 Page 8 of 9

Quantity	100	Price	23.44	Amount	2344.00	Trade Date	02/13/08
Processing Fee					5.35	Settle Date	02/19/08
Transaction Fee	,					ML Symbol	C PRU
Accrued Interes	t/Dividends				:	Security #	52GY3
Charge or Mark	Up/Down				32.79	Cusip #	17310G202
						FA#	4966

CALLABLE-MAY AFFECT YIELD DETAILS UPON REQUEST PX LESS INT 23.164700 ACCRUED INT 27.53 EXECUTED 100PC NYSE 061 DAYS INTEREST ML ACTED AS AGENT

SEE ABOVE FOR TRANSACTION DETAILS

### BOUGHT CITIGROUP CAP TRUST XV TRUST PFD SECS 06.500% SEP 15 2066

Quantity	300	Price	23.45	Amount	7035.00	Trade Date	02/13/08
Processing Fe	00					Settle Date	02/19/08
Transaction F	96					ML Symbol	CPRU
Accrued Inter	est/Dividends	3				Security #	52GY3
Charge or Ma	rk Up/Down				98.36	Cusip #	17310G202
						FA#	4966

CALLABLE-MAY AFFECT YIELD DETAILS UPON REQUEST PX LESS INT 23.174667 ACCRUED INT 82.60 EXECUTED 100PC NYSE 061 DAYS INTEREST ML ACTED AS AGENT

SEE ABOVE FOR TRANSACTION DETAILS

#### BOUGHT CITIGROUP CAP TRUST XV TRUST PFD SECS 06.500% SEP 15 2066

Quantity	200	Price	23.54	Amount	4708.00	Trade Date	02/13/08
Processing Fe	0					Settle Date	02/19/08
Transaction Fe	96					ML Symbol	C PRU
Accrued Intere	est/Dividends		,	,		Security #	52GY3
Charge or Mai	rk Up/Down				65,57	Cusip #	17310G202
						FA#	4966

CALLABLE-MAY AFFECT YIELD DETAILS UPON REQUEST PX LESS INT 23.264650 ACCRUED INT 55.07 EXECUTED 100PC NYSE 061 DAYS INTEREST ML ACTED AS AGENT

SEE ABOVE FOR TRANSACTION DETAILS

#### BOUGHT CITIGROUP CAP TRUST XV TRUST PFD SECS 06.500% SEP 15 2066

Quantity	900	Price	21.70	Amount	19530.00	Trade Date	05/21/08
Processing Fee	9				5.35	Settle Date	05/27/08
Transaction Fe	e					ML Symbol	C PRU
Accrued Intere	st/Dividends					Security #	52GY3
Charge or Mar	k Up/Down				398.03	Cusip #	17310G202
						FA#	4966

EXECUTED 100% AGENCY CALLABLE-MAY AFFECT YIELD DETAILS UPON REQUEST PX LESS INT 21.388544 ACCRUED INT 280.31 EXECUTED 100PC NASDAQ 069 DAYS INTEREST ML ACTED AS AGENT

### SEE ABOVE FOR TRANSACTION DETAILS

Payment for securities or other investment purchased, and delivery of securities or other investments instruments sold, are due on SETTLEMENT DATE unless otherwise indicated by a DATE DUE. Delivery on or before settlement date will avoid premium charges. Please preserve this confirmation for income tax purposes. If submitting payment or correspondence, please write your account number, shown on the bottom of this page, and forward to "Merrill Lynch Office Serving your Account", shown on top right of page 1. If you have moved or plan to move, notify your Financial Advisor of your new address.

Account Number: 838-89178 Date: 05/21/2008 Page 2 of 3 040993

P.O. Box 2044 Lakewood, NJ 08701



Merrill Lynch Office Serving Your Account 7424 WINDSOR DRIVE ALLENTOWN PA18106-9304 (610) 398-4200

MLPF& S CUST FPO BRUCE SMACKEY BASIC FBO BRUCE M SMACKEY 418 N PINE TOP CIR BETHLEHEM PA 18017

TO THE HOUSEHOLD OF: ARDETH M SMACKEY 418 N PINE TOP CIR BETHLEHEM PA 18017-1861

TRADE CONFIRMATIONS FOR THE FOLLOWING ACCOUNTS INCLUDED IN THIS PACKAGE:

838-89178

MLPF& S CUST FPO BRUCE SMACKEY BASIC FBO BRUCE M SMACKEY 418 N PINE TOP CIR RETHI EHEM PA 18017 Account Number

## TRADE CONFIRMATION

Date: July 10, 2009

We confirm the following transaction(s) subject to the agreement below.

### SOLD CITIGROUP CAP TRUST XV TRUST PFD SECS 06.500% SEP 15 2066

Quantity	1500	Price	15.50	Amount	23250.00	Trade Date	07/10/09
Processing Fe	90				5.35	Settle Date	07/15/09
Transaction F	00				0.60	ML Symbol	C PRU
Accrued Inter	est/Dividends					Security #	52GY3
Charge or Ma					310.06	Cusip #	17310G202
3 5 6 5 7 5 7 7 3		*******			######################################	FA#	4966

EXECUTED 100% AGENCY CALLABLE-MAY AFFECT YIELD DETAILS UPON REQUEST PX LESS INT 15.364580 ACCRUED INT 203.13 030 DAYS INTEREST UNSOLICITED ORDER ML ACTED AS AGENT

### SEE ABOVE FOR TRANSACTION DETAILS

Payment for securities or other investment purchased, and delivery of securities or other investments instruments sold, are due on SETTLEMENT DATE unless otherwise indicated by a DATE DUE. Delivery on or before settlement date will avoid premium charges. Please preserve this confirmation for income tax purposes. If submitting payment or correspondence, please write your account number, shown on the bottom of this page, and forward to "Merrill Lynch Office Serving your Account", shown on top right of page 1. If you have moved or plan to move, notify your Financial Advisor of your new address.

Account Number: 838-89178 Date: 07/10/2009 Page 1 of 2